be prepared to vote on the basis of that general tendency. But once the other side has admitted that the issue is important, then Cicero's interpretation (if believed) becomes not only true but decisive.

In this paper I have selected a number of examples of the strategy of appropriation and reversal of opposing arguments (or at least their premises) in the orations of Cicero. This strategy receives little notice in rhetorical theory (none at all in Cicero's *rhetorica*), at least in part because it crosses the boundaries of *argumentatio* and *refutatio*. Despite this lack of explicit prescription, the appropriative strategy is encouraged by the general hermeneutics imposed by formal rhetoric. The schematization of rhetorical *inventio* narrows the range of possible arguments, making them more predictable and thus more subject to this kind of refutation. And, in a highly adversarial system such as the Roman courts, agreement (or the semblance of agreement) between the parties provides a useful and specific source for bases of argument: it creates facts and establishes their relevance to the case at hand. So a number of features of both formal rhetoric and the courtroom situation silently but effectively conspire to encourage the use of the appropriative strategy.[42]

ANDREW M. RIGGSBY
*University of Texas,
Austin*

VERGIL IN THE GRYNEAN GROVE:
TWO RIDDLES IN THE THIRD *ECLOGUE*

The poetic contest of *Eclogue* 3 between Damoetas and Menalcas ends with an exchange of riddles, at lines 104–7:

DAMOETAS: Dic quibus in terris (et eris mihi magnus Apollo)
             tris pateat caeli spatium non amplius ulnas.
MENALCAS: Dic quibus in terris inscripti nomina regum
             nascantur flores, et Phyllida solus habeto.

"Tell me where—and you will be my great Apollo—
the space of heaven extends not more than three ells."
"Tell me where there grow flowers inscribed with the
names of kings, and you alone will have Phyllis."

Efforts to solve these riddles seem to have begun with Vergil's contemporaries and have continued among modern scholars.

Each riddle has two components: a question (itself in two parts) and a prize. Both riddles begin with the question "where," *quibus in terris;* but that question cannot be answered until one identifies the "what." In the riddle of Damoetas, one must first

divine the meaning of "a space of heaven not more than three *ulnae* wide"; and in the riddle of Menalcas, the identity of the flowers that bear the names of kings.

Solution of the riddle brings a prize. Damoetas will make Menalcas, if successful, his Apollo: an appropriate reference, as Servius says, because in uncertain affairs there is need for divination. Menalcas has already claimed the protection of Apollo at lines 62–63:

> "Et me Phoebus amat: Phoebo sua semper apud me
> munera sunt, lauri et suave rubens hyacinthus."

By solving the riddle of Damoetas, Menalcas will become his own patron deity. Menalcas, on the other hand, promises to Damoetas sole possession of Phyllis, for whose love the two singers seem to have been rivals.

The riddle of Menalcas seems an easy one to solve. The words "flowers inscribed with the names of kings" point to an obvious aetiology: the story of the hyacinth, which sprang up either upon the accidental death of Hyacinthus, the beloved of Apollo, or upon the suicide of Telamonian Ajax.[1] The flower consequently bore on its leaves markings that ancient authors, at least, could read as the letter upsilon from the name Hyacinthus, or the letters alpha iota from αἰαῖ, the cry of woe, or from the name Αἴας.[2] Both Hyacinthus and Ajax, Servius explains, were the sons of kings. Menalcas himself has already mentioned the *suave rubens hyacinthus,* "the sweetly blushing hyacinth," and the laurel as appropriate gifts to Apollo (62–63). The laurel, like the hyacinth, is part of an aetiological myth that involves Apollo and an object of his desire, namely Daphne, who in order to escape Apollo was turned into the laurel tree. Daphne was the daughter of Amyklas, according to Parthenius, and thus the sister of Hyacinthus.[3]

Servius found no point to the riddle of Menalcas, for the hyacinth flower, he says, grows everywhere. The verb *nascor,* however, can possess the narrower sense of "to originate" as well as the sense "to grow." If we consider the spots where the hyacinth first appeared, we confront three possible answers: the Lakonian town of Amyklae, where Hyacinthus was killed; the Troad, where Ajax died and received a

1. Hyacinthus: Nic. *Ther.* 902–6. Ajax: Euphorion, frag. 40 Powell, *Coll. Alex.* Ovid reports both aetiologies, first that of Hyacinthus at *Met.* 10.162–219 where Apollo promises Hyacinthus that one day the name of a very brave hero will also be read on the same flower, and that of Ajax at *Met.* 13.384–98. Servius on *Ecl.* 3.106, citing Ovid as his source, relates both stories, as do Junius Philargyrius and the Berne scholia.

2. Upsilon from the name Hyacinthus: Servius on *Ecl.* 3.106; Junius Philargyrius on *Ecl.* 3.63. Note that Servius does not follow Ovid with respect to the flower's markings. Alpha iota from αἰαῖ, the cry of woe: Ovid *Met.* 10.206, 13.394–98; Paus. 2.35.5; Junius Philargyrius on *Ecl.* 3.106. Alpha iota from the name Αἴας: Ovid *Met.* 10.207–8, 13.394–98; Junius Philargyrius on *Ecl.* 3.106; Berne scholia on *Ecl.* 3.107.

Robert Coleman (on *Ecl.* 3.63) provides a succinct summary of the controversy over the flower's identification: "It is not clear that all the Greek and Latin references to the *hyacinthus* are to the same flower. Identifications by modern authorities include the corn-flag (Gladiolus Segetum), martagon (Lilium Martagon), and red asphodel" (*Vergil "Eclogues"* [Cambridge, 1977], 118). James Frazer identified the flower as Delphinium Ajacis and recorded his debt to Miss J. E. Harrison for two specimens "on which the woeful letters were plainly visible" (*The Golden Bough.* Part IV: *Adonis Attis Osiris,* vol. 1 [London, 1914], p. 314, n. 1).

3. *Amat. Narr.* 15. Daphne is elsewhere the daughter of a river god, either Ladon (as in Servius on *Ecl.* 3.63) or Peneius (Ovid *Met.* 1.452–567). In Pausanias, Hyacinthus is the son of Amyklas (3.1.3) and has a sister Polyboea who died a maiden (3.19.4). Ovid (*Met.* 13.396) and Junius Philargyrius (on *Ecl* 3.106) call Hyacinthus the son of Oebalus. Apollodorus calls Hyacinthus the son of Clio and Pierus (*Bibl.* 1.3.3) and the son of Amyklas and Diomede (3.10.3). For Daphne and Hyacinthus, see Timothy Gantz, *Early Greek Myth* (Baltimore, 1993), 55, 90–91, 94, 216.

funeral mound; and Salamis, where the hyacinth appeared on the death of Ajax, the island's hero.[4]

The riddle itself provides a clue to a different answer. The name of Phyllis, the prize offered for solution of the riddle, suggests yet another aetiology, as Savage noted.[5] Phyllis was deserted by her lover, either Akamas or Demophoon, both sons of Theseus; she hanged herself and was turned into an almond tree without leaves. The tree sprouted leaves when Phyllis' lover returned and embraced the tree. Hence, the leaves were called φύλλα (Serv. on *Ecl.* 5.10). Vergil shows his knowledge of this myth at *Eclogue* 5.10, where Menalcas calls upon Mopsus to sing the *Phyllidis ignes,* "the passions of Phyllis," and at *Eclogue* 7.59, where Thyrsis says "Phyllidis adventu nostrae nemus omne virebit," "at the arrival of my Phyllis the entire grove will be green."

The presence of these aetiologies in the riddle of Menalcas suggests that the answer to the question "where there grow flowers inscribed with the names of kings" might be "in some author read by Vergil." One author who may have written about both the hyacinth and Phyllis is the Hellenistic poet Euphorion of Chalkis. In Powell fragment 40, Euphorion writes that "one story of the singers" says that the hyacinth sprang up in the Troad upon the death of Ajax; this phrase implies that Euphorion went on to relate the other aetiology, that of the death of Hyacinthus.[6] Euphorion seems to have mentioned Phyllis in connection with the story of Laodike, the daughter of Priam, who bore a child either to Akamas or to Demophoon. Tzetzes records three lines of Euphorion, which recount that a snake killed the child of Laodike while the child was hunting with his father in Thrace.[7] Tzetzes follows this with a story of Phyllis and Akamas (in other accounts, it is Demophoon).[8] Phyllis gave her lover a box upon his departure; when she despaired of his return, she cursed her lover and committed suicide. At that moment, her lover opened the box, was driven mad, and was killed in a fall from his horse.

We can point to one work of Euphorion in which aetiologies of flowers and trees might have played a part—his description of the grove of Apollo at Gryneion. At *Eclogue* 6.72, Gallus is called upon to sing the *Grynei nemoris origo,* "the origin of the Grynean grove." In his comment on the passage, Servius outlines the story told by Euphorion in the poems "quae Gallus transtulit in sermonem latinum," "which Gallus translated into Latin." Servius places in the grove a contest in divination between the seers Calchas and Mopsus. The contest was to give the number of pieces of fruit on a certain tree; when Mopsus gave the correct answer, Calchas died of grief. Servius Auctus describes the grove as "locus arboribus multis iucundus, gramine

4. Laconian Amyklae: Nic. *Ther.* 902–6; Junius Philargyrius on *Ecl.* 3.63. Troad: Euphorion, frag. 40 Powell, *Coll. Alex.* Salamis: Paus. 1.35.4. Note that Pausanias does not call the flower that sprang up on Salamis the hyacinth: "Those who dwell around Salamis say that the flower first arose in their land when Ajax died; it is white, reddish, both the flower itself and its leaves smaller than the lily, and there are letters on this plant like those on hyacinths."

5. J. J. H. Savage, "The Art of the Third Eclogue of Vergil (55–111)," *TAPA* 89 (1958): 150–51.

6. Franz Skutsch, *Aus Vergils Frühzeit* (Leipzig, 1901), 80, following Erwin Rohde, *Der griechische Roman* (Leipzig, 1876), 97, n. 3: cited in D. E. W. Wormell, "The Riddles in Virgil's Third Eclogue," *CQ* 10 (1960): 29 and n. 3.

7. Tzetzes, on Lycophron *Alexandra* 495 = Euphorion frag. 58 Powell. Pausanias rejects Euphorion's account of Laodike as unlikely, but he fails to mention *what* Euphorion said (Paus. 10.26.8 = Euphorion frag. 72 Powell).

8. In Apollodorus, for example (*Epit.* 6.16–17).

floribusque variis omni tempore vestitus," "a place pleasant with many trees, adorned with grass and various flowers at every season." Ross characterizes these words of Servius Auctus as a prose summary of Cornelius Gallus' ekphrasis of the Grynean Grove; while Brown suggests that the ekphrasis was Euphorion's.[9] In either case, aetiologies for flowers and trees, like the hyacinth and almond, would be appropriate in the poetic description of such a locale. The hyacinth is twice appropriate: for the story of Hyacinthus, the beloved of Apollo, the resident god of the grove, and for the story of Ajax, who died in the Troad not too far (at least for poetic purposes) from Gryneion.[10]

Vergil makes explicit the link between the hyacinth, Phyllis, and the grove in the song of Gallus in *Eclogue* 10.[11] At *Eclogue* 10.37–43, Gallus sings:

> "certe sive mihi Phyllis sive esset Amyntas
> seu quicumque furor (quid tum, si fuscus Amyntas?
> et nigrae violae sunt et vaccinia nigra),
> mecum inter salices lenta sub vite iaceret;
> serta mihi Phyllis legeret, cantaret Amyntas.
> hic gelidi fontes, hic mollia prata, Lycori,
> his nemus; hic ipso tecum consumerer aevo."

> "Surely either my Phyllis, or Amyntas,
> or some cause of passion—what of it, if Amyntas is dark?
> Violets are black and hyacinths black—
> one of them would lie with me among the willows under the clinging vine;
> Phyllis would gather garlands for me, Amyntas would sing.
> Here there are cold fountains, here soft meadows, Lycoris,
> here a grove; here with you I would be consumed by time itself."

Therefore, I propose the following answer to the riddle of Menalcas: the hyacinth grows in the "Grynean Grove."

The riddle of Damoetas has proved much more difficult for scholars ancient and modern; indeed, Vergil is supposed to have said that he planted a *crux* for the *grammatici* in this riddle, according to a story from Asconius repeated by the ancient commentators. Vergil's own answer, according to the commentators, was "the tomb of Caelius," the burial place of a wastrel from Mantua who managed to save from the family property only enough space in which to bury himself. Other ancient answers

9. D. O. Ross, *Backgrounds to Augustan Poetry* (Cambridge, 1975), 79–80; E. L. Brown, "Damoetas' Riddle Euclid's Theorem 1.32," *Vergilius* (1978): 27–28 and nn. 30 and 36.

10. Gryneion is on the coast of Aeolis, 30 kilometers south of Pergamum. Gryneion is about as close to the Troad as is the historical Phrygia of Greek and Roman times; and Phrygia is regularly associated with Troy in poetry.

11. The identity of *vaccinia* at *Ecl.* 10.39 with the *hyacinthus* seems assured by Theocritus 10.28 (καὶ τὸ ἴον μέλαν ἐστί, καὶ ἁ γραπτὰ ὑάκινθος). Page argues (on *Ecl.* 2.18) that the *vaccinium* is identical with the *hyacinthus* in the *Eclogues* (*P. Vergili Maronis "Bucolica" et "Georgica"* [London, 1898], 105); Coleman (on *Ecl.* 2.18, 50) identifies *vaccinium* as the bilberry ("*Eclogues,*" 95, 102).

Servius, Junius Philargyrius, and the Berne scholia all identify the *vaccinia* (at *Ecl.* 2.18) as *violae purpureae*, which seems to make *Ecl.* 10.39 tautological. Both Junius Philargyrius and the Berne scholia (on *Ecl.* 3.106–7) say that *violae* sprang from the blood of Ajax.

Robert Maltby reports no etymology for *vaccinium* (*A Lexicon of Ancient Latin Etymologies* [Leeds, 1991]), which might support the contention that *vaccinium* is cognate with ὑάκινθος. S. P. Vander Kloet argues for the derivation of *vaccinium* from *bacca*, "berry" ("On the Etymology of *Vaccinium* L.," *Rhodora* 94 [1992]: 371–73).

involved various wells, pits, or caves.[12] Modern solutions have tended to the astro-nomical, the literary, or some combination of the two. Savage suggests the altar of Terminus in the temple of Jupiter Capitolinus; Wormell, an orrery or planetarium; Putnam, the space of heaven allotted to Amalthea, the nurse of Jupiter; Clay, Vergil's own hexameters; Brown, the theorems of Euclid; and Campbell and Hofmann, the papyrus roll containing the *Phaenomena* of Aratus.[13]

One ancient answer that has attracted little notice is that reported by Junius Phil-argyrius and the Berne scholia, namely, "the shield of Ajax, three *ulnae* in size, on which was shown the form of heaven."[14] At first glance, this answer might appear to have been neglected for good reason, for no ancient author seems to give Ajax such a decorated shield depicting the heavens. Rather, his shield is "like a city-wall," constructed of seven layers of bull-hide and an eighth of bronze (*Il.* 7.219–23). What the ancient commentators seem to have in mind is the shield of Achilles, which did indeed show the earth, the heavens, the sea, the sun, moon, and constel-lations (*Il.* 18.477–608). This shield was part of the armor for which Ajax competed with Odysseus. While this armor was first awarded to Odysseus, it did finally come into the possession of Ajax. When Odysseus was shipwrecked, the armor of Achilles washed up on the grave of Ajax in the Troad.[15] In this way, then, Ajax did come to have a shield showing the form of the heavens.

The riddle itself points to this answer with the phrase *caeli spatium*, "the space of heaven." Varro (*Ling.* 5.19) says that Ennius called the heavens the *caeli clipeus*, "the shield of the sky." Vergil, then, may be exploiting the supposed similarity between the hollow of a shield and the hollow of the sky in his phrase, "a space of heaven not more than three *ulnae* wide." Varro also says (*Ling.* 5.18) that the word *caelum* was thought to be derived from *caelatum*, "embossed." Vergil uses the word *caelatum* at *Eclogue* 3.37, in the description of the beechwood cups of Menalcas that depict the astronomer Conon and "that other one," *quis fuit alter,* who described the heavens.[16] The astro-nomical subject of the embossed cups points to the *caeli spatium*, the "space of

12. Servius (on *Ecl.* 3.105) begins with a definition of *ulna:* "ulna proprie est spatium, in quantum utraque tenditur manus—dicta ulna ἀπο τῶν ὠλενῶν, id est a brachiis, unde et λευκώλενος dicitur—, licet Suetonius ulnam cubitum velit esse tantummodo." He then says that some say the answer is the tomb of Cae-lius, others say a well at Syene in Egypt, dug in order to prove that the sun's rays shone directly on the town at the summer solstice. Servius argues that neither answer is suitable for a *rusticus.* The correct answer, he says, is any well; for if one descends into a well, the space of heaven visible corresponds to the width of the well. Junius Philargyrius (ad loc.) reports the story from Asconius that Vergil had planted a crux and that Vergil's answer was the tomb of Caelius; he mentions also a cave in Sicily where Hades seized Perse-phone. The Berne scholia (ad loc.) mentions the *mundus* or ritual pit in the sanctuary of Ceres. In none of these answers does the measure of three *ulnae* (whatever an *ulna* is) seem to play a crucial role in the answer.

13. J. J. H. Savage, "The Riddle of Vergil's Third Eclogue," *CW* 47 (1954): 81–83; Wormell, "Rid-dles," 29–32; M. C. J. Putnam, "The Riddle of Damoetas (Virgil *Ecl.* 3,104–105)," *Mnemosyne* 18 (1965): 150–54; Jenny Strauss Clay, "Damoetas' Riddle and the Structure of Vergil's Third Eclogue," *Philologus* 118 (1974): 59–64; Brown, "Damoetas' Riddle," 25–31; J. S. Campbell, "Damoetas' Riddle: A Literary So-lution," *CJ* 78 (1982–83): 122–26; Heinz Hofmann, "Ein Aratpapyrus bei Vergil," *Hermes* 113 (1985): 468–80.

14. Both Junius Philargyrius and the Berne scholia incorporate the measurement in this answer, while none of the other answers suggested by them or by Servius does. Junius Philargyrius says "caeli spatium idest clipeum Aiacis dicunt trium ulnarum, in quo expressa caeli forma fuit." The Berne scholia gives the shield answer first in the entry: "Alii dicunt clipeum Aiacis trium ulnarum in quo expressa caeli forma fuit."

15. *Anth. Pal.* 9.115, 116; Paus. 1.35.4, 5. Pausanias attributes the story that the armor of Odysseus washed up on the tomb of Ajax to the Aeolians who later inhabited Troy; and he says that a Mysian told him that it was possible to enter the tomb where the sea had washed it away and that the knee-bones of Ajax were the size of a discus for the boys' pentathlon.

16. For the identity of the other figure on the beechwood cups, see Roger S. Fisher, "Conon and the Poet: A Solution to *Eclogue,* III, 40–2," *Latomus* 41 (1982): 802–14. Harald Ingholt describes a pair of silver

heaven" in Damoetas' riddle, as Segal noted;[17] and Vergil may also be constructing a kind of *schema etymologicon* in his use of the words *caelatum* and *caeli*.

Euphorion, as we have seen, connects the hyacinth with the death of Ajax. Perhaps he went on to relate the story of the contest for the arms of Achilles and even to describe the shield. I suggested above that the aetiology of the hyacinth would have found an appropriate setting in Euphorion's description of the Grynean Grove. Gryneion may seem too far from the Troad and the tomb of Ajax, even by the standards of poetic geography, to advance a claim that the shield of Achilles "washed up" in the Grove. On the other hand, the story of the hyacinth would justify its inclusion, as would some actual features of the Grove. Pausanias (1.21) mentions linen breastplates hanging in the grove, which suggests dedications of very early armor; and Varro reports that chains and shackles were fixed to the trees in the grove.[18] Therefore, I propose the following answer to the riddle of Damoetas: the shield of Achilles hangs in the "Grynean Grove."

The story of Ajax serves to link the two riddles. In the riddle of Damoetas, we have the shield of Achilles that showed the form of the heavens; the loss of this shield to Odysseus drove Ajax to suicide. In the riddle of Menalcas, we have the hyacinth, the flower that sprang up from the blood of Ajax and bore his name. Allusions to the hyacinth, the almond, and the laurel in the riddle of Menalcas and elsewhere in *Eclogue* 3 point to aetiological stories appropriate to the poetic description of the Grynean Grove, "a place pleasant with many trees, adorned with grass and various flowers at every season." As I showed above, Vergil links the hyacinth, Phyllis, and a pleasant grove in the song of Gallus in *Eclogue* 10. This suggests that Cornelius Gallus had previously incorporated the stories of the hyacinth and of Phyllis in his description of the Grynean Grove.

Servius provides one further piece of evidence to clinch the connection between the two riddles of *Eclogue* 3 and the Grynean Grove. We saw above that in his comment on *Grynei nemoris origo* at *Eclogue* 6.72, Servius places in the grove a contest in divination between the seers Calchas and Mopsus. He names as his source for this story "Euphorionis . . . carmina, quae Gallus transtulit in sermonem latinum." We can now see why Vergil ended the poetic contest of *Eclogue* 3 with the riddles: they recall the contest of the two seers in the Grynean Grove and thus point to Vergil's poetic forebears, Euphorion and Cornelius Gallus, and to their ekphrases on the Grynean Grove.

Farrell comments on the poetic contest in *Eclogue* 3: "The amoebean contest, in which Menalcas consistently fashions his poetry out of what Damoetas has just sung, presents an image of poetic composition as a process of exchange between poets. . . . we can hardly avoid reading this contest as an emblem of Vergil's agon with the founder of bucolic poetry as well."[19] In the final exchange between Damoetas

---

skyphoi from Berthouville, Normandy, depicting Aratus and Uranus on one side and a young man and standing lady on the other ("Aratos and Chrysippos on a Lead Medallion from a Beirut Collection," *Berytus* 17 [1967–68]: 143–77). I owe this reference to Professor Mary Pendergraft.

17. C. P. Segal, "Vergil's *Caelatum Opus*: An Interpretation of the Third *Eclogue*," *AJP* 88 (1967): 297–98.

18. Servius Auctus on *Ecl.* 6.72; cited by W. R. Nethercut, "Menalcas' Answer: The Hyacinth in *Bucolic* 3.106–107," *CJ* 65 (1970): 251, n. 12.

19. Joseph Farrell, "Literary Allusion and Cultural Poetics in Vergil's *Third Eclogue*," *Vergilius* 38 (1992): 68.

and Menalcas, the railing shepherds become "Alexandrian singers, literate and learned"[20] who compose obscure aetiological riddles; and at one further remove they stand in for the epic seers Calchas and Mopsus engaged in their deadly contest of riddles. The exchange in *Eclogue* 3 is not only between Vergil and his predecessor in bucolic, Theocritus, but also between Vergil and his predecessor in the creation of Augustan poetry, Gallus.

The riddles of *Eclogue* 3.104–7 point toward both appearances of Gallus in the *Eclogues*. Linking Euphorion and Gallus in the riddles with Orpheus, Conon, and Aratus on the shepherds' embossed cups, we have a portion of the "poetic genealogy" that Vergil works out in greater detail in the song of Silenus in *Eclogue* 6.[21] The complex of stories mentioned in or suggested by the riddles of *Eclogue* 3.104–7 mirrors the themes of Silenus' song, which Ross calls "a perfect demonstration of the possibilities of the new poetry" pioneered by Gallus:[22] aetiological (the hyacinth, the laurel, Phyllis, the origin of the Grynean Grove), allusion to a different tradition in the relating of another (Ajax and Hyacinthus for the hyacinth), pastoral (Damoetas and Menalcas are shepherds, after all), darker aspects of erotic experience (Phyllis, Daphne, and Hyacinthus), metamorphoses (blood into flowers, Daphne into the laurel, and Phyllis into an almond tree).

At *Eclogue* 10.50–54, Gallus sings:

> "ibo et Chalcidico quae sunt mihi condita versu
> carmina pastoris Siculi modulabor avena.
> certum est in silvis, inter spelaea ferarum,
> malle pati, tenerisque meos incidere amores arboribus . . . "

> "I will go and the songs which I composed in Chalcidian verse
> I will play on the reed of the Sicilian shepherd.
> I am resolved in the woods, among the dens of wild animals,
> to choose to suffer, and to carve my loves on tender trees . . . "

Gallus will turn his verse in the manner of Euphorion into pastoral and give his elegies (*amores*) a pastoral setting.[23] What Vergil's Gallus promises to do in *Eclogue* 10, Vergil has done at the end of *Eclogue* 3: he has taken aetiological material from Euphorion and from Gallus' *Amores* and has given it a pastoral setting in his *Eclogues*.[24]

<div align="right">

T. KEITH DIX
University of Georgia

</div>